# SHANGHAI UNIVERSITY, JUNE 29-30, 2016 "RECIPROCITY: A HUMAN VALUE IN A PLURALISTIC WORLD" (GUANGMING OUYANG (EO); tianen@shu.edu.cn

#### **BISOSIATIVE DIALECTIC IN PLURALISME**

By.

# Wiwik Setiyani

wiwiksetiayani@uinsby.ac.id Islamic State University Sunan Ampel Surabaya Indonesia

#### Abstract

Religion teaches moral values that gave birth to the attitude of love and tolerance towards other religions. Religion means behavior and attitude as the teachings of religion because religion is action. Religion is not ideology or doctrine that is vertical, however, must be interpreted contextually and horizontal nature, therefore, religion is not the main purpose, however, religion is the benefit of the people. Religious diversity must be understood as a form of competition obtaining goodness that can be enjoyed or felt by all the people. Dialectics is the proper way in understanding religious pluralism or diversity. Dialectic process can be done in various ways which can be translated into a particular dialectic, personal and universal. The human ability to articulate pluralism is the power of creativity between the logic of reason to analyze the real conditions in the community called bisosiative. Objectives achieved peace created beings are called *ummatan wahidatan* means, the people of one but not the only religion on the contrary, religious diversity or pluralism. Recognition of the existence of other religions to encourage people to always reflect and learn with others without giving birth to religious truth claims however, be a source of inspiration for interpreting the dialectic of society that never eroded by time. Bisosiative is the dialogue process through the power of thought and creativity action with particular regard to the principles and personal use that can give birth to universal principles. Loved the universal principles is the real form of human values to the world of plurality as inevitability.

Key Word: pluralism, bisosiative, dialectic,

## **Preliminary**

Religious diversity or plurality is a necessity that it can't be ignored. Religious diversity becomes a source of inspiration to learn from what is taught and provide values for the good of mankind. Understanding the teachings of each religion can eliminate the truth claims of religion are merely thought but, goodness religious teachings can be implemented in everyday life that is worth *maslahah*/helpful for others. Through actions based on religious teachings will give birth to rivalry between religions be an act of kindness to build a civilization based on human values.

Religion will not only be seen at the level of theology but, referring to the actions of its adherents. Measures religious believers can be done through a dialectic with the public good, in particular, personal and even universal. Dialectics is not limited to-face through dialogue however, must be translated through concrete actions. Human thought became a major foothold for analyzing the condition of the people who have a diversity of religions is not to be contradicted however, is a valuable lesson to show the human values that truth. The action is good and true on the basis of religious teachings can create a sense of love and benefit of the people even, *ummatan wahidatan* as a manifestation of human values.

Acts of kindness religious believers to be a reflection of other religions at the same time being a good example and have an impact on competition between religions goodness. The impact is expected by all of humanity that recognizes and understands pluralism as real action. Understanding pluralism means to recognize the humanity and as a human being must humanize therefore, called human values. Human reasoning became the main tool to view and generate concrete actions and a comprehensive dialogue media thought but not limited, to penetrate the perceived benefits to other human beings regardless of their religion.

## **Religion as Actions**

People have become a major asset in realizing social harmony through various activities. Social harmony is a picture of a society that is dynamic and creative. Harmonious society can be realized if, as a religious community is able to implement behavior. Religious doctrines are contextually understood not textually. Hence, religion is not the main purposes, however, religion is for the benefit of the people, as described in the Our'an:

Allah disdains not to use the similitude or lower than that. As for those who believe it, they believe that it is the truth from their Lord, but those who disbelieve say: "What does Allah mean by this parable?." with a parable that many people are misled by the parable of God and (also) a lot of people that He leads and no one except Allah misled, those who are wicked. (the Qur'an:2:26)

Through the guidance of a religious man walked closer to God and expect Him Grace. Good deeds multiply the vertical dimension (Religious ritual) and horizontal (social service). Because, religion is basically comes with the mission of kindness, sacred and

loaded with universal values. The goal is that, people live in peace, harmony with the environment, by the rules and abide by the teachings of God.

Religion teaches unity and peace of the people who gave birth to mutual respect and respect for others. Indeed, every religion has teachings and has a uniqueness in social life. The unity of humanity and the well-being regardless of race, religion, national or social status. Peace and unity of the *Umat* (*ukhuwah wat*}*ani*>*yah*/ *ukhuwah insa*>*niyah*) is a normative teachings of Islam that the reception not only on religious differences but also the diversity of race, gender, nationality and ethnicity. The Qur'an teaches universal brotherhood and acceptance of pluralism in society that can generate social harmony.

The phenomenon of religious diversity is a necessity, Swami Bhajananda explains the importance of religious harmony, there are two significant reasons include: first, religious conflicts caused by internal and external conflicts. Intrinsic namely, to religious doctrine in looking at 'other religions'. While externally caused by the manipulation of religion that is, by political interests. Second, referring to the study of the history of religious conflict, which is largely due to the issue of religious independence. Two reasons indicate that religion is conceived vertically not horizontally so interpreted, the offense occurred among religious followers.

Therefore, attention to religion not only theological, vertically, however, be interpreted in understanding religion horizontally. Interpretation horizontally constructed through the community activities, to get closer to one another so that, childbirth attitude of appreciation and belonging (tolerance). The attitude is necessary because, mutual tolerance is not war or cornering but, instead of peace, harmony and respect for each other that foster social harmony. Islam teaches social harmony through mutual help or mutual aid with other people.

In line with Bourdieu's theory of habit and arenas explained that, habits can be described as the logic of the game, a practical sense that encourage agents to act practically and react. While the *arena* is a concrete social situations governed by a set of objective social relations. The adherents of the religion plays a role in building the social harmony in their environment through religion. Ways is by submit Islam not only at the level of the concept yet, touching aspects of the implementation by conducting activities that could have an impact on others. Teaching activities into the routine activities that bring the

community or congregation in understanding religion more deeply to establish patterns of relationship healthy, social service by sharing with others the love that, would be a 'buffer zone' and gave birth to harmony among communities that are always present automatically. These attitudes is an implementation of religion as an act or behavior that spawned social harmony because, belief in religion is very urgent, Confidence interpretations of truth, meaning and intentional. The adherents of the religion carry out the obligations of religion, such as the implementation of religious teachings (religious rituals), Implementation of religious teachings may establish togetherness, solidarity, instilling kindness, debunk and most importantly create peace and harmony between people, therefore, understood religion to be aware of two things: the first, in the history of religion must be seen and understood without exception as a cultural phenomenon. Second, the cultural experience before the modern era, based on the locus of the community alone, while Thomas Luckman describes religion as a social construction that has solidity, adhere to the system of symbols and individual trancendet on compliance religious practices.

Religion is a characteristic of human social life are universal meaning, all of society has ways of thinking and patterns of behavior that qualify as 'religion' (religious). Ellis, leader therapy cognitive behavioral explains: religion is dogmatic, orthodox and observant (which we might call piety) however, tolerate much more provide leniency, open and love are expected to have the maturity to understand his religion properly through the implementation of religious teachings in everyday life.

#### Goodness action Interfaith as Pluralism

Religious life constantly refers to the teachings of religion as a guideline to be true theologically. Truth theology (vertical) every religion has a horizontal impact goodness for humans and the universe. The belief of the adherents of the doctrine above becomes a media dialogue thought to be translated into life. Translating each diverse faiths resulted in the decision that lead to action with a view for the good of all mankind.

Measures religious followers with the right intention can produce a good decision though, can lead to competition between religions, as in the teachings of Islam teaches competition in goodness. Goodness in every religion whose teachings can be applied by any religious observance is proof of the people. Observance of religious teachings the duty

of every believer who loves his religion. Because religion is a belief for human life and the safety of human events, both personal and communal. Road safety conducted by referring to three important aspects are: first, to understand the process of salvation. Second, make changes correctly and third, achieve naturally. The basic concept of salvation passed to the process that often there is a difference of interpretation in the act that gave birth to different actions. For example, the implementation of religious celebration with a variety of rituals. Rituals become a cultural as well as a characteristic of the present culture, religions without religious cultures can be grown as a person but, without a religious culture as a collectivity do not have a place. Cultural action in the name of religion can give birth to a variety of inter-religious group with the purpose of the safety process can be passed well. Among the solutions that safety in the name of religion; their processes, changes and these objectives acquire appreciation of the faiths in ways that do. The practice of religious celebration gave birth to the concepts of interest as the action of salvation in religious ceremony in Java. Geertz classified into four (4) sections are: first, related to the salvation of life crisis, include: birth, circumcision, marriage and death. Second, salvation related to the events in the calendar. Third, net of social integration and a fourth village, something that depends on events that are not normally, for example: leaving for a long journey, moving, change of name of the person, chronic disease, witchcraft and so forth.

A wide variety of actions carried into a culture that can be understood as a pluralism in society. The diversity of the safety measures that do religious communities is a necessity in society and shape society in the form of cultural collectivity. Through religious practices do religious people is the meeting point of religion which gave birth to harmony irrespective of ideology, tribe, gender, nationality and ethnicity. Pluralism able to solving different cultures are born of religion and the Koran teaches universal brotherhood and acceptance of pluralism in society, as the basis for acceptance of pluralism.

The history of Islam in Indonesia, especially in Java played by clerics (*kyai*, *Ajengan*, *master teacher*, *tengku*, *buya*), its role and position have contributed in the Islamic community. The struggle both at the level of formal religious institutions and informal local leaders to form a relationship that is not only based on the organization. The role of religious actors have a major influence in shaping the culture because, believers trust the truth that is based on local clerical leadership and the leadership of the rationale

for the institution of Islamic organizations. Local leadership was the inspiration and foundation religious believers foster a culture called the local wisdom. Acts of kindness of local wisdom is a form of pluralism with a mission of salvation for all people.

Therefore, all religions have salvation and truth value in accordance with the argument of their respective religions so, in pluralism should not be compared or contrasted. The reality of pluralism is a necessity of thought and human action, when unity is needed however, is necessarily limited \ thus not all lumped exclude. The concept is intended that pluralism is the view that all religions are the same road to the core of religious reality. Religion is no more superior because all religions are considered valid to God. As revealed by Nicholas Rescher that; appreciate the existence of pluralism is to appreciate his view either individually or in groups. The view is also confirmed in Islamic thought that is: there is no compulsion in the religion of the plurality thus a reality that can be understood by doing acts of kindness religious teachings.

# **Understanding Religion with Dialectics**

Religious dogma not only vertically but can be done, should have an impact on the horizontal. The implementation religious teachings often resulting understanding of religion as an ideology of religion whereas a higher value than ideology so, most people make religion as a source of ideology to its adherents. Religious understanding spawned a variety of interpretations, which can create a new culture in the community, including carrying out religious activities.

The interaction of religion and culture are two different aspects vertically, thus, need to be interpreted in religious and cultural understanding horizontally. Interpretation horizontally constructed through the dialectic of society. Dialectics between people of the generation of ideas as diverse as Hegel's dialectical theory paradigm. Interpretation of Hegelian dialectics refers to three (3) categories namely: subjects 'internal' objectionable 'external' and synthesis 'internalizing and externalizing logic and the notion'. Implementation of religious teaching is done by establishing inter-religious relations through media dialectic which can be used as a communication bridge between religious communities.

Religion is a private area and culture of the region together, to build tolerance to the community is a necessity because, mutual tolerance is not war or cornering but, instead of peace, harmony and respect each other. Islamic perspective, there are several ways that can be used as a foothold in the framework of thinking for Muslims, namely: *first*, the belief of every Muslim; mutual respect for any religion or any kind of color. *Second*, people of different religions is the reality of God's will and be a personal choice of each people. *Third*, every Muslim is not burdened with the responsibility of the infidels. *Fourth*, every Muslim must do justice, and to invite the good deeds though, among the people there is idolatrous, hate justice and violations of the law.

To understand religion needs to be done with two (2) ways, namely: first, the metaphysical aspect / belief. Second, aspects of expression / tradition. Beliefs and traditions will always face and form religious history form, a collection of important stories that, a tradition known and understood cumulatively and the wider community. Cumulative tradition is not a static phenomenon but, alive and dynamic because, cumulative tradition are active participants in shaping the convergence of human diversity. Convergence will always exist in any particular religion, religious traditions. Every believer will support and co-operation among mankind. The way to do is to look at other religious traditions as their own. Explores the experience of other traditional religions, should be interpreted as a cultural heritage in general, so, there will be no confidence that are considered strange or irrelevant because, to feel involved in the life of God. Dialectics of religion can be done with some religious teachings, among them: God, rituals, traditions, and mysteries. All religions believe about God however, any mention of God vary, ranging from Islam (Allah), Christianity (Jesus), Hindu-Buddhist (Sang Hyang Widi wasa), Confucianism (Thian). These religions believe that God's religion is a universal religion. Each religion has a normative foundation contained in the holy books each.

Aspects of ritual, tradition and mystique every religion have in common however, is different in execution. In this aspect of religion has the outside / exoteric or hand in / esoteric. Frithjof Schuon isoterik be explained on the side of the goals of religions, namely: the divine nature's real hidden hidden inside. Two of these dimensions to be unique to strengthen the position of religion because religion can be studied with different points of view or approach. Some of that approach, emphasized that religion is also universally well

studied, the level of authenticity, and the bearer of his. Factors that as a comparison once the uniqueness of each religion.

Inter-religious dialectics can be seen, how Islam recommends to do good to people of other faiths. This principle is also taught that all religions, always keep a good relationship with anyone, it means tolerance or understanding other religions is the key augur well for the religious life. Symbol of the power of religion can be seen from the building form of worship of different religions, from mosques, churches, synagogues and temples. Practices religious rituals are performed each religion is a form of submission of a higher strength than anything. On the other hand, the practice of religion as a social and cultural forces that humanity is worth because it is not wrong if the dialectics of religion is the actualization of the theology of humanity.

The Muslims are *Khayr ummah ummah Wasat* and explained that, the Muslims should be able to realize ourselves as a society with three requirements, among them; First, the Muslims can live together with the followers of the other and not separate life and shut down of global life. Secondly, the unity of the Muslims and Islamic solidarity should not lead to acts etnocentres or exploitation material and acts of aggression, whereas the Muslims should cooperate in maintaining peace, and promoting moral. Third, the Muslims always willing to listen and learn from the experiences of others and then take things that are good.

The dialectic of the real meaning of religion for human life, logic reasoning used instead to narrow viewpoint, however, to understand their religion and not the religion itself. Therefore, the rise of Islam as a par excellent, is not the only unique but, because of their previous religions. Essensi religions above, is as weltanschauung, namely; resignation to the Lord of the entire universe without limits is also the creator, God.

Dialectics of religion is a key driver in building a strong relationship patterns. The attitude of respect for one another, is a key meeting that will produce some of the decisions that the ideals of the religious of all nations. Lofty ideals bequeathed to religious communities will create order live peacefully alongside each other which form a harmonious life as a form of peace that gave birth to the culture. Religion is not history but, religious life will bear historical and cultural form. The events interesting and unique is the complexity of the phenomena which can be used as a science that forms the

historical logic: power politics, science, social, legal and cultural, religious complex phenomena. The essence of dialectics religions is to explain the achievements of a religions to reach the 'civilization'.

#### **Dialectics Bisosiative**

The dialectic to be of main requirements to find the right way to build interreligious communication. Dialectics is the dialectical interpretation of the theory and practice. Interpretation of Hegelian dialectic refers to three categories, namely: subjects' internal 'objectionable' external 'and synthesis' internalizing and externalizing logic and notion. Hegelian dialectic theory is a form of awareness of individuals 'self-consciousness'. Religious meeting with the community in a variety of activities are oriented horizontally dialectic on the value of life. Relationship with one another is the dialectical relationship of mutual interest that refer to two (2) important parts namely: the transformation at the macro level and the micro level of the revolution. Dialectics on macro and micro levels to go through a long process for maximize result.

Contemplation and thought processes performed by the religious communities; using a rational interpretation. Conversely, people who are not religious namely, denial of the phenomenon need to get an explanation and understanding. Based on a process of reflection and these ideas, religions will be able to meet with any (cultural, political, legal, economic etc.) and at any time (the time and space / time and space). Religion will always be in contact with any subject if the activity was oriented to the values of life religion teaches then, a rational attitude in responding to the situation of people is the key answer. Therefore, to understand the dialectics of religion should be done as a whole aspect as instruments and functions. Instruments and the inherent function of religion is to bring together the power of religious communities in various forms of activities.

Dialectics is done in the form of individual dialogue that produces a variety of interpretations of each individual on the basis of logical argument held that the individual logic is the fact that allowing occur logical form of dialect and understand the teachings of the social context through the dialectic of universal interpretation. In isoterik aspects of religion can only be understood in particular by individuals based on the aspects of development that occurs without neglecting the aspect of an individual's experience as an

actor. Dialectics in the form of good dialogue, personal, particular and universal need to do an individual actor as one way to develop their potential through knowledge of objects that produce social values, moral, economic and even political. The strength of the individual (subject) and knowledge (object) must be able to read the situation and the conditions to achieve the objective benefit of the people.

Individual as the object of knowledge body and be able to analyze social issues that can provide comfort for the community though, people also need to understand the mismatch between expectations and what is actually happening either, on the unity of the community and cultural unity. The attitude of people is a form of struggle with a variety of strategies with the aim of instilling public confidence in social believe (as empathetic behavior through religion) then, others will be achieved by itself.

Frameworks by taking into account a variety of strategies and make the process of dialogue is dialectic bisosiative namely through a natural process that is done in ways plagiation of a soft manner and do not lead to the wrong interpretation. Therefore, there are two (2) ways to do that: First, to understand his thinking as a difference from the way of thinking and acting. *Second*, being able to distinguish between themselves and others. Ability organizing how it can shape the personality as well as a self-existence. The process produces a dynamic system of communicating between individuals.

In the dialectic bisosiative should avoid absolute aspect that is based on a detailed account of the failure *expotisi metafisix* transcendental dialectic. Therefore, the eclectic system of choice to get the right answer; by combining and seek appropriate solutions with different groups.

## **Pluralism Action Product Bisosiative**

View of pluralism is the right choice because, pay attention to the phenomenon of increasingly complex society. Pluralism is not equating the view, however, appreciate and understand the differences as inevitability. Pluralism is the view that all religions are the same road to the core of religious reality. Religion is no more superior because all religions are considered valid to God. Human beings as God's creatures have a proper way to understand the difference either; the issue of religion, ethnicity, language, tradition or culture. As Nicholas Rescher explained that, appreciate the existence of pluralism is to

appreciate his view either individually or in groups. The ability of individuals to appreciate the views of individuals or other groups means giving and establish an open dialogue with other people.

Therefore, pluralism is not an abstract idea or thought, however, the product of an attitude or action is based on three (3) important aspects: *first*, to have an open attitude. *Second*, appreciate the tolerance. *Third*, the upholding of democratic values and the fourth, a plurality of a necessity that it can not be inevitable. The phenomenon of pluralism into the needs of individual attitude that seeks to combine the logic of reason and reality of a society which is called bisosiative action. Bisosiative can be understood as any behavior or actions of individuals that have meaning interpretation and significance of the subject individual information. Interpretation of individuals through the generative process, the cognitive aspect in the form of ideas or the ideas implemented in action. Individual action is a process of self realization emanation or who have a mystery because, done spontaneously. The effects of these actions have a meaning or subjective meaning for him and directed the actions of others.

Bisosiative not only through the cognitive aspects but also on the actions of individual affective namely by doing 'realism' or explanatory as a form of independence an objective that, relations with surrounding people always needed to be, relationship with the community is maintained. Therefore, individuals or groups of people who recognize and understand pluralism are the people who always keep the dynamic of society as a form of action bisosiative. The goal is to maintain the sustainability or viability of the security environment in order, always dynamic and constructive.

## Conclusion

Dialectics is one appropriate method to understand pluralism in society. Some form of dialectics is done with three important aspects are: *first*, the particular dialectic. *The second*, personal dialectic and third, universal dialectic. Individual actors initiation dialectics by integrating personality through bisosiative action. Bisosiative action is the implementation of ideas or thoughts with generative processes of various dialectics with social phenomena.

Pluralism is a cultural product that originated from the diversity of the complex and

give rise to new thinking for analysis and found the right way. Bisosiative thought to contribute significantly to act with due regard to particular matters, personal order, to get the values are universal. The diversity of the complex of any diversity in the world is a necessity for it, pluralism as a product of culture or religion continue to color the world civilization. Bisosiative provide an alternative solution that is contributive to reinforce the meaning of the actions of individual actors in the understanding of pluralism perfectly.

#### References

- Adler Mortimer J., *Truth in Religion the Plurality of Religions and the Unity of Truth,* New York: Macmillan Publishing Company, 1990.
- Ahluwalia Muninder K. and Anjali Alimchandani, "A Call to Integrate Religious Communities into Practice: The Case of Sikhs" dalam <a href="http://www.apa.org/education/ce/integrate-religious-communities.pdf">http://www.apa.org/education/ce/integrate-religious-communities.pdf</a> 20 Juni 2014.
- al Qar}d}a>wy Yu>suf, *Ghoir al Muslimii>n fi> al Mujtama' al Isla>my*, lihat www.almustafa.com (20 Maret 2014.
- Badawi Jamal A., Hubungan Antar-agama: Sebuah Perspektif Islam dalam Memahami Hubungan Antar-agama, terj. Burhanuddin Dzikri, Yogyakarta: Sukses Offset, 2007.
- Barkun Michael, a Culture of Conspiracy Apocalyptic Visions in Contemporary America, California: The University of California Press, 2003.
- Berry Bonnie, *Social Rage Emotion and Cultural Conflict*, New York: Garland Publishing, 1999.
- Bhajananda Swami, *Harmony of Religion from Standpoin of Sri Ramakrisna and Swami Vivekananda*, Kolkota: Ramakrisna Mission Institut of Culture, 2007.
- Bleeker C.J., *Pertemuan Agama-Agama Dunia: Menuju Humanisme Religius dan Perdamaian Universal*, terj. Syafaruddin, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Dian Pratama, 2004.
- Bourdieu Pierre, *Arena Produksi Kultural; Sebuah Kajian Sosiologi Budaya*, Bantul: Kreasi Wacana, 2012.
- Cahill Michael, *The Environment and Social Policy*, New York: Routledge, 2002.
- Cantwell Wilfred Smith, *Kitab Suci Agama-Agama*, terj. Dede Iswadi, Jakarta: Mizan, 2005.
- Durkheim Emile, *The Elementary Form of Religious Life*, terj. Karen E. Fields, New York: The Free Press, 1995.
- Edgar Andre and Peter Sedgwick, *Key Concepts in Cultural Theory*, New York: Routledge, 1999.
- Ellis, Journal of Counseling and Clinical Psychology, New York: Oxford University

- Press 1980.
- Fraklin Adrian, Nature and Social Theory, London: Sage Publication, 2002.
- G.E Moore, 'The Value of Religion', dalam *International Journal of Ethic*, Vol. 12. No.1, Oktober 1991.
- Gabriel Markus, 'The Dialectic of the Absolute: Hegel's Critique of Transcendent Metaphysic' dalam Nectarios G. Limnatis, *The Dimension of Hegel's*, New York: Continuum International Publishing Group, 2010.
- Gal Ofer and Raz Chen-Morris, 'Empiricism without the Senses: The Instrument Replaced the Eye', dalam Charles T. Wolfe and Ofer Gal, *The Body as Object and Instrument of Knowledge*, New York-London: Springer, 2010.
- Geertz Clifford, Religion of Java, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1976), 30.
- George Hans- Gadamer, *Hegel's Dialectic: Five Hermeneutical Studies*, terj. Christoper, London: Yale University Press.
- Hick John, "The Next Step Beyond Dialogue" dalam *the Myth of Religious Superiority a Multifaith Exploration*, Ed. Paul F. Knitter, New York: Orbis Book, 2005.
- Hidayat Komaruddin, *Agama untuk Kemanusiaan dalam Atas Nama Agama*, editor Anggito, Bandung: Pustaka Hidayah, 1998.
- Hidayat Komaruddin, *Dilema Obyektifitas Agama*, dalam Jurnal PERTA, Vol IV/NO.01, Jakarta: Depag RI, 2001.
- Hilmy Masdar, *Islam, Politik dan Demokrasi: Pergulatan antara Agama, Negara dan Kekuasaan* (Surabaya: Imtiyaz, 2014), 22.
- Keene James J., "Baha'i World Faith: Redefinition of Religion" dalam Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion, Volume 6 no 2, Autumn, 1967.
- Kleman David E. and William Schweiker, *Religion and the Human Future an Essay on Theological Humanism*, Singapore: Blackwell Publishing, 2008.
- Klemola Juhani (ed) dkk, *Type of Variation, Dialectal and Typological Interfaces*, Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 1984.
- Kuntowijoyo, Muslim Tanpa Masjid: Essai-Essai Agama, Budaya dan Politik dalam Bingkai Strukturalisme Transendental, Bandung: Mizan, 2001.
- Limnatis Nectarios G., *The Dimensions of Hegel's Dialectic*, New York: Continiuum International Publishing, 2010.
- Machasin, Struggle for Authority between Formal Religious Institution and Informal-Local Leaders, dalam Varieties of Religious Authority, Ed. Azyumardi Azra, Kees Van Dijk, Singapore: ISEAS, 2010.
- Madjid Nurcholish, *Islam Doktrin Dan Peradaban*, Jakarta: Dian Rakyat, Paramadina, 2008.
- Mcgrath Alister E., *Christian Theology: an Introduction*, Oxford: Blackwell Publisher, 1994.
- Mingers John, "Information, Meaning, and Communication: an Autopoietic Approach"

- dalam Sociocybernetics: Complexity, Autopoiesis and Observation of Social Systems, London: Greenwood Press, 2007.
- Mondal Anshuman A., Nationalism and Post Colonial Identity: Culture and Ideology in India and Egypt, London: Routledge Curzon, 2003.
- Munawar Budhy al-Rachman, Ensiklopedi Nurcholish Madjid, Pemikiran Islam di kanvas Peradaban, Jakarta: Mizan, 2006.
- Munawar Budy al-Rachman, *Islam Pluralis: Wacana Kesetaraan Kaum Beriman*, Jakarta: Paramadina, 2001.
- Nevins Andrew, *Locality in Wovel Harmony Linguistic Inquiry Monographs*, London: the MIT Press, 2010.
- O'dea Thomas F., Sosiologi Agama Suatu Pengenalan Awal, terj. Jakarta: Rajawali, 1987.
- OsmaFathi n, "Islam and Human Right, The challenge to Muslim and The World", dalam *Rethinking Islam and Modernity*, ed. Abdel Wahab El-Effandi, London: The Islamic Foundation, 2001.
- Parsons Talcott, Sociological Theory, New York-Illinois: The Free Press, 1954.
- Rescher Nicholas, *Pluralism: Against the Demand of Consensus*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 88.
- Rifa'i Muhammad Abduh, *Textual dan Kontextual Interpretation Towards Religious Harmony in Indonesia*, dalam *Antologi Studi Agama*, Ed. Rahmat Fadjri, Yogyakarta: Jurusan Perbandingan Agama, 2012.
- Rowls John, A Brief Inquiry into the Meaning of Sin and Faith with on my Religion, London: Harvard University Press, 2009.
- Sarfuddin Endang Anshari, *Ilmu Filsafat dan Agama*, Surabaya: Bina Ilmu, 1987.
- Schuon Frithjof, Form and Substance in the Religions, Canada: World Wisdom, 2002.
- Setiyani Wiwik, "Hak Azasi Manusia dalam Wacana Keislaman di Indonesia", *Jurnal Islamedia*, ISSN 1411-4763, Volume 11 No. 1 Th. 2011.
- Smart Barry, Michael Foucault Key Sociologist, New York: Routledge, 2002.
- Smart Ninian, *Sebuah Pengantar* dalam Peter Cornnolly, *Aneka Pendekatan Studi Agama*, Jakarta: Lkis, 2012.
- Thompson Michael, Richard Ellis, Aaron Wildavsky, *Cultural Theor*; San Francisco: Westview Press, 1990.
- Vitz Paul C., *Religion as Psychology: the Cult of Self-Worship*, United State America-Michigan, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1994.
- Voltaire, *Traktat Toleransi*, terj. Yogyakarta: Lkis, 2004.
- Von Kaspar Greyerz, *Religion and Culture in Early Modern Europe 1500-1800*, terj. Thomas Dunlap, New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- William H. Sewell JR., *Logics of History: Social Theory and Social Tranformation*, Chicago-London: University of Chicago Press, 2005.

